

From: [REDACTED]@uw.edu]
Sent: 4/19/2022 12:39:11 PM
To: [REDACTED]@twitter.com; [REDACTED]@gmail.com]; [REDACTED] (Gmail)
[REDACTED]@gmail.com]; [REDACTED] (CSIS) [REDACTED]@csis.org]; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]@illinois.gov]
CC: Wyman, Kim (She/Her/Hers) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; Hale, Geoffrey (He/Him) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov];
Tsuyi, Megan [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]
Subject: HOMEWORK Re: CSAC MDM April 12 Meeting Summary
Importance: High

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of DHS. DO NOT click links or open attachments unless you recognize and/or trust the sender. Contact your component SOC with questions or concerns.

Hello MDM Subcommittee members,

We had an excellent meeting on Tuesday and I want to provide updates to the members who were not able to attend as well as some homework for all of us. We've been asked to provide an initial set of recommendations to Director Easterly and the committee at the June meeting. (We may develop additional recommendations for incorporation at a future date. These would just be our first set.) Due to other dependencies within that process, we will need to **draft our initial recommendations by mid-May** — giving us just a month to develop those recommends.

With that timeline in mind I want to propose the following for the next few meetings:

- Prior to our April 26 meeting: subcommittee members suggest initial draft recommendations for discussion.
- April 26 meeting: Prioritize recommendation ideas and assign (self-select) subcommittee members to (co)write initial drafts.
- May 10: Discuss and refine initial drafts of recommendations.

This means that we all have a little **homework for April 26**. I'd like you all to come up with **2-3 initial ideas for recommendations** — and for you to **share these with the group via email by midday April 25** (the day prior to our next meeting). That will give us a little time to organize those for our conversation on April 26.

I'm including the original list of questions for our committee to help guide the brainstorming process.

To help with the generation process, I'll mention some initial recommendation ideas we surfaced in the last meeting:

Deliberative Process

Original framing questions:

Deliberative Process

On Apr 18, 2022, at 3:25 AM, CISA_CybersecurityAdvisoryCommittee

<[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov> wrote:

CSAC MDM Subcommittee Members,

Attached, please find the meeting summary from the Tuesday, April 12, 2022 CSAC MDM subcommittee meeting. Please review the summary for important updates regarding next steps for the CSAC MDM Subcommittee. We anticipate sending the April 26 meeting agenda along and read-aheads early this week, please be sure to review in advance of the meeting to ensure we can have a productive discussion regarding next steps.

If you have any questions, please contact Megan Tsuyi, CSAC Designated Federal Officer, at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov, or the CSAC support team at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov.

Best Regards,

The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee Support Team

Stakeholder Engagement Division

Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency

[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov

<image001.png>

Confidentiality Notice: The information in this email and any attachments may be privileged and confidential. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify the sender and permanently delete the email and any attachments immediately. You should not retain, copy or use this email or any attachments for any purpose, nor disclose any part of the contents to any other person.

<CSAC MDM Subcommittee Meeting Summary_04122022.pdf>



CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Protecting Critical Infrastructure from Misinformation & Disinformation Subcommittee Meeting May 24, 2022

Purpose of Meeting

- The purpose of the CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee (CSAC) Protecting Critical Infrastructure from Misinformation & Disinformation (MDM) Subcommittee meeting was for Subcommittee members to review and discuss the draft recommendations to present during the CSAC June Quarterly Meeting as well as the DHS Disinformation Governance Board.

Discussion

- Mr. James Nash, Alternate Designated Federal Officer (ADFO) for the MDM Subcommittee, brought the meeting to order and introduced the newly appointed ADFO for the MDM Subcommittee, Ms. Kirsten Heidelberg, CISA.
- Dr. Kate Starbird, Associate Professor, Human Centered Design & Engineering, University of Washington, MDM Subcommittee Chair, discussed the Subcommittee's recommendations to present during the CSAC June Quarterly Meeting and the path forward to strategically approach MDM in the government during the current discourse. Dr. Starbird restated the Subcommittee's commitment to transparency but expressed concern for the Subcommittee's efforts and cautioned the group on how to communicate their ongoing work.
 - Ms. Vijaya Gadde, Legal, Public Policy, and Trust and Safety Lead, Twitter, affirmed this caution and shared her recent communication cautioning Director Easterly about her own involvement in the Subcommittee's work given the fraught time, especially in advance of the election season.

Deliberative Process



**CISA
CYBERSECURITY
ADVISORY
COMMITTEE**

Deliberative Process



**CISA
CYBERSECURITY
ADVISORY
COMMITTEE**

Deliberative Process

- Mr. Nash thanked the Subcommittee for their input, noted that he will flag the initial recommendations as a draft in revision, and adjourned the meeting.



CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Action Items

- A1: Subcommittee members will refine the list of recommendations to present for Committee vote during the CSAC June Quarterly Meeting.
- A2: Dr. Starbird and Ms. Spaulding will contact Mr. Jameel Jaffer for input on their initial recommendations.
- A3: Ms. Gadde will brainstorm additional SMEs to recruit to aid the Subcommittee's efforts, particularly progressive civil rights and civil liberties advocates.
- A4: Mr. Nash will notify CSAC Support that the Subcommittee's initial recommendations are under current revision.
- A5: Subcommittee members will discuss recommendations to socialize their efforts with Director Easterly.



CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Attendees*

Participants

Name

Dr. [REDACTED]
Ms. [REDACTED]
Mr. Geoff Hale
Ms. [REDACTED]
Ms. Kim Wyman

Organization

University of Washington
Twitter
CISA
CSIS
CISA

Other Meeting Attendees

Name

Ms. Gwen Hess
Ms. [REDACTED]
Ms. [REDACTED]

Organization

CISA
CSIS
JP Morgan Chase

Government and Contractor Support

Name

Ms. Megan Tsuyi, DFO
Mr. James Nash, ADFO
Ms. Kirsten Heidelberg
Ms. [REDACTED]

Organization

CISA
CISA
CISA
TekSynap

**Meeting was held via Teams/teleconference*

From: Kate Starbird [kstarbi@uw.edu]
Sent: 4/19/2022 12:39:11 PM
To: [REDACTED]@twitter.com; [REDACTED]@gmail.com] [REDACTED] (Gmail)
 [REDACTED]@gmail.com]; Suzanne Spaulding (CSIS) [REDACTED]@csis.org]; Tate-Nadeau, Alicia [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]@illinois.gov]
CC: Wyman, Kim (She/Her/Hers) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; Hale, Geoffrey (He/Him) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov];
 Tsuyi, Megan [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]
Subject: HOMEWORK Re: CSAC MDM April 12 Meeting Summary
Importance: High

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of DHS. DO NOT click links or open attachments unless you recognize and/or trust the sender. Contact your component SOC with questions or concerns.

Hello MDM Subcommittee members,

We had an excellent meeting on Tuesday and I want to provide updates to the members who were not able to attend as well as some homework for all of us. We've been asked to provide an initial set of recommendations to Director Easterly and the committee at the June meeting. (We may develop additional recommendations for incorporation at a future date. These would just be our first set.) Due to other dependencies within that process, we will need to **draft our initial recommendations by mid-May** — giving us just a month to develop those recommends.

With that timeline in mind I want to propose the following for the next few meetings:

- Prior to our April 26 meeting: subcommittee members suggest initial draft recommendations for discussion.
- April 26 meeting: Prioritize recommendation ideas and assign (self-select) subcommittee members to (co)write initial drafts.
- May 10: Discuss and refine initial drafts of recommendations.

This means that we all have a little **homework for April 26**. I'd like you all to come up with **2-3 initial ideas for recommendations** — and for you to **share these with the group via email by midday April 25** (the day prior to our next meeting). That will give us a little time to organize those for our conversation on April 26.

I'm including the original list of questions for our committee to help guide the brainstorming process.

To help with the generation process, I'll mention some initial recommendation ideas we surfaced in the last meeting:

Deliberative Process

Kate

Original framing questions:

Deliberative Process

On Apr 18, 2022, at 3:25 AM, CISA_CybersecurityAdvisoryCommittee

<[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov> wrote:

CSAC MDM Subcommittee Members,

Attached, please find the meeting summary from the Tuesday, April 12, 2022 CSAC MDM subcommittee meeting. Please review the summary for important updates regarding next steps for the CSAC MDM Subcommittee. We anticipate sending the April 26 meeting agenda along and read-aheads early this week, please be sure to review in advance of the meeting to ensure we can have a productive discussion regarding next steps.

If you have any questions, please contact Megan Tsuyi, CSAC Designated Federal Officer, at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov, or the CSAC support team at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov.

Best Regards,

The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee Support Team

Stakeholder Engagement Division

Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency

[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov

<image001.png>

Confidentiality Notice: The information in this email and any attachments may be privileged and confidential. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify the sender and permanently delete the email and any attachments immediately. You should not retain, copy or use this email or any attachments for any purpose, nor disclose any part of the contents to any other person.

<CSAC MDM Subcommittee Meeting Summary_04122022.pdf>

From: [REDACTED]@fb.com]
Sent: 1/28/2022 2:11:11 PM
To: Rose, Kris (He/Him) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]
CC: [REDACTED]@fb.com]; [REDACTED]@fb.com]; WYMAN, KIM [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; CISA COS [REDACTED]@hq.dhs.gov]; Hale, Geoffrey [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; Goldstein, Eric (He/Him) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; Sessoms, Charmaine Lee [REDACTED]@CISA.DHS.GOV]; CLEMONS, CHAUNDRA [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; [REDACTED]@fb.com]
Subject: Re: Schedule briefing

Kris,

Thanks for the quick reply.

The agenda looks good to us. + Becky Moore, cc'd above, to help sked on our side.

Best,
[REDACTED]

On Jan 28, 2022, at 1:28 PM, ROSE, KRIS (He/Him) <[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov> wrote:

Thank you, Director – moving you to BCC.

[REDACTED] – it's great to meet you! I'm including our scheduling team here to set something up in the near-term. Per Geoff, it sounds like we may want to discuss three primary topics:

- 2022 Elections
- Risk management in the face of influence operations
- JCDC

Let us know if that is correct and we can find 30 minutes on the Director's calendar. Thank you!

Kris

Kristopher Rose (he/him)
Senior Advisor to the Director
Cybersecurity & Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA)
[REDACTED] (Mobile)
[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov



Click here to read the Core Values, Core Principles, and the Foundations of CISA Culture.

From: Easterly, Jen (She/Her) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>
Sent: Friday, January 28, 2022 1:07 PM
To: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; ROSE, KRIS (He/Him) <[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; WYMAN, KIM
[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>; CISA COS <CISACOS@hq.dhs.gov>; Hale, Geoffrey <[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>;
GOLDSTEIN, ERIC <[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>
Subject: RE: Schedule briefing

Hi Brian –

Looping in Kris & teammates to please follow up.


Thanks!
jen

From: [REDACTED]@fb.com>
Sent: Friday, January 28, 2022 12:29 PM
To: Easterly, Jen (She/Her) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov>
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com> [REDACTED]@fb.com>
Subject: Schedule briefing

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of DHS. DO NOT click links or open attachments unless you recognize and/or trust the sender. Contact your component SOC with questions or concerns.

Hi Jen,

[REDACTED] mentioned that you had spoken about receiving a briefing from us on 2022 election approach. We're happy to do with your team at your convenience—and we'd also love to discuss further how we might help support the JCDC effort. Let us know what works best for you?

[REDACTED] |  Meta
US Public Policy
575 7th St, N.W., Suite 700
Washington, D.C. 20004
[REDACTED]



CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE FACTSHEET

The Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA) Cybersecurity Advisory Committee provides the CISA Director with recommendations on matters related to the development, refinement, and implementation of policies, programs, planning, and training pertaining to the cybersecurity mission of the Agency.

Background

The National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2021, P.L. 116-283 (<https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/house-bill/6395/text>) directed the Secretary of Homeland Security to establish a Cybersecurity Advisory Committee within CISA. The Committee was formally established in June 2021.

Purpose

The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee provides independent, strategic, and actionable consensus recommendations to the CISA Director on a range of cybersecurity issues, topics, and challenges, including but not limited to: information exchange; critical infrastructure; risk management; and public and private partnerships. The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee meets at least twice per year to discuss its activities.

Composition

The CISA Director may appoint up to 35 members to the Committee. CISA's Director, Jen Easterly, has initially appointed 23 members to the Committee and will appoint future members to represent additional perspectives and expertise. Members can be reappointed for an unlimited number of terms. The Committee Chair and Vice Chair each serve for a term of two years.

Current Activities

The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee held its first meeting on December 10, 2021. At the meeting, the Committee elected Mr. Thomas Fanning, CEO of Southern Company, to serve as the Committee's Chair and Mr. Ron Green, Chief Security Officer of Mastercard, to serve as the Committee's Vice Chair.

Also at the meeting, the Director tasked the Committee with six key issues in support of CISA's cybersecurity efforts:

- Transforming the Cyber Workforce;
- Turning the Corner on Cyber Hygiene;
- Technical Advisory Council;
- Protecting Critical Infrastructure from Misinformation and Disinformation;
- Building Resilience and Reducing Systemic Risk to Critical Infrastructure; and
- Strategic Communications.

The Committee has established subcommittees to examine these topics.



**CISA
CYBERSECURITY
ADVISORY
COMMITTEE**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Chair

Mr. [REDACTED]
Chairman, President, and CEO
Southern Company

Mr. [REDACTED]
Mayor
Austin, Texas

Ms. [REDACTED]
Chief Information Security Officer
Johnson & Johnson

Ms. [REDACTED]
Chief Information Officer
JPMorgan Chase

Mr. [REDACTED]
James A. Baker III Chair in the Rule of
Law and World Affairs
University of Texas School of Law

Ms. [REDACTED]
Legal, Public Policy & Trust and Safety
Lead
Twitter

Dr. [REDACTED]
Chancellor
University of Pittsburgh

Ms. [REDACTED]
Board Member
Tenable

Mr. [REDACTED]
Chief Executive Officer
Mandiant

Vice Chair

Mr. [REDACTED]
Executive Vice President and Chief Security Officer
Mastercard

Mr. [REDACTED]
President
DEF CON Communications

Ms. [REDACTED]
Senior Vice President & Chief Counsel,
Digital Citizenship
Walmart

Ms. [REDACTED]
Cybersecurity Journalist

Mr. [REDACTED]
Chief Executive Officer
Cloudflare

Mr. [REDACTED]
General Partner
Kleiner Perkins Caufield & Byers

Mr. [REDACTED]
Chief Security Officer
Amazon Web Services

Ms. [REDACTED]
Senior Advisor for Homeland Security
Center for Strategic and International
Studies

Mr. [REDACTED]
Partner
Krebs Stamos Group

Dr. [REDACTED]
Associate Professor, Human Centered
Design & Engineering
University of Washington

Mr. [REDACTED]
Vice President of Corporate Information
Security
Apple

Ms. Alicia Tate-Nadeau
Director
Illinois Emergency Management Agency

Ms. [REDACTED]
Principal
NWong Strategies

Mr. [REDACTED]
Executive Vice President of Business
Development, Strategy, and Ventures
Microsoft

From: [REDACTED]@uw.edu]
Sent: 4/19/2022 12:39:11 PM
To: [REDACTED]@twitter.com; [REDACTED]@gmail.com] [REDACTED] (Gmail)
 [REDACTED]@gmail.com]; [REDACTED] (CSIS) [REDACTED]@csis.org]; Tate-Nadeau, Alicia [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]@illinois.gov]
CC: Wyman, Kim (She/Her/Hers) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]; Hale, Geoffrey (He/Him) [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov];
 Tsuyi, Megan [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov]
Subject: HOMEWORK Re: CSAC MDM April 12 Meeting Summary
Importance: High

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of DHS. DO NOT click links or open attachments unless you recognize and/or trust the sender. Contact your component SOC with questions or concerns.

Hello MDM Subcommittee members,

We had an excellent meeting on Tuesday and I want to provide updates to the members who were not able to attend as well as some homework for all of us. We've been asked to provide an initial set of recommendations to Director Easterly and the committee at the June meeting. (We may develop additional recommendations for incorporation at a future date. These would just be our first set.) Due to other dependencies within that process, we will need to **draft our initial recommendations by mid-May** — giving us just a month to develop those recommends.

With that timeline in mind I want to propose the following for the next few meetings:

- Prior to our April 26 meeting: subcommittee members suggest initial draft recommendations for discussion.
- April 26 meeting: Prioritize recommendation ideas and assign (self-select) subcommittee members to (co)write initial drafts.
- May 10: Discuss and refine initial drafts of recommendations.

This means that we all have a little **homework for April 26**. I'd like you all to come up with **2-3 initial ideas for recommendations** — and for you to **share these with the group via email by midday April 25** (the day prior to our next meeting). That will give us a little time to organize those for our conversation on April 26.

I'm including the original list of questions for our committee to help guide the brainstorming process.

To help with the generation process, I'll mention some initial recommendation ideas we surfaced in the last meeting:

- **Present a scoping/framing for CISA's mission around MDM and elections**, focusing on election methods, procedures, and infrastructure; and providing some insight for how to incorporate related concerns such as MDM threats to the judicial system.
 - **Recommend CISA convene organizations and election officials** for a strategic planning session prior to Election 2022 to identify threats/strategies for mitigation and to develop frameworks for long-tail of jurisdictions to develop plans and pre-stage resources to fight MDM.
 - **Create recommendations to continuing/refining the mission of Rumor Control for 2022/2024.**
- Please let me know if you have any questions or other feedback! I'm looking forward to a productive meeting next week!

Original framing questions:

- What should CISA's role be in the MDM space? How should it leverage its unique capabilities and mission to contribute to this space, without becoming duplicative of other efforts and remaining focused on its mission?
- How would the Committee balance CISA's efforts between the need to build resilience to MDM, broadly, versus activities to address MDM narratives, specifically? This distinction can be understood as broad public education and awareness campaigns versus rumor control, amplifying credible information, type efforts.
- How can CISA inspire innovators to partner with the government in a way that catalyzes availability of trusted information without being seen as government "propaganda"?
- What is the right model for CISA engagement with social media and other media entities?
- How should CISA and the USG maintain situational awareness of MDM and detect efforts to manipulate the information environment? What is the balance between social listening, privacy, and protected speech?

On Apr 18, 2022, at 3:25 AM, CISA_CybersecurityAdvisoryCommittee

<[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov> wrote:

CSAC MDM Subcommittee Members,

Attached, please find the meeting summary from the Tuesday, April 12, 2022 CSAC MDM subcommittee meeting. Please review the summary for important updates regarding next steps for the CSAC MDM Subcommittee. We anticipate sending the April 26 meeting agenda along and read-aheads early this week, please be sure to review in advance of the meeting to ensure we can have a productive discussion regarding next steps.

If you have any questions, please contact Megan Tsuyi, CSAC Designated Federal Officer, at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov, or the CSAC support team at [REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov.

Best Regards,

The CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee Support Team

Stakeholder Engagement Division

Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency

[REDACTED]@cisa.dhs.gov

<image001.png>

Confidentiality Notice: The information in this email and any attachments may be privileged and confidential. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify the sender and permanently delete the email and any attachments immediately. You should not retain, copy or use this email or any attachments for any purpose, nor disclose any part of the contents to any other person.

<CSAC MDM Subcommittee Meeting Summary_04122022.pdf>